Teacher Answer Key

Case Study

1. DeShawn gained actual writing skill — the ability to construct and defend an argument, use counterarguments strategically, identify weak points in his own reasoning, and revise effectively. Maya gained a grade. DeShawn can reproduce his process independently six months later; Maya cannot write a strong argumentative paragraph without AI because she never built the underlying skill.

2. Applying the test to Maya: she cannot defend most sentences in her draft because she did not write them — she would have to say 'the AI wrote that.' Applying it to DeShawn: he can explain every claim, every piece of evidence, and why he structured the essay the way he did because all of those decisions were his. The test reveals that the grade being the same masked a profound difference in ownership and understanding.

Multiple Choice

1. A
2. D
3. B

Matching

1-B, 2-C, 3-E, 4-A, 5-D

Fill-in-the-Blank

1) defend, 2) cognitive, 3) skill

Short Answer (Sample Responses)

Q1: Brainstorming uses AI to expand your thinking before you write — you still decide what to argue and how to structure it, so the thinking and decision-making that develops writing skill still happen. Having AI write for you removes all of that cognitive work, which means no skill is developed. The first approach builds capability; the second only produces output.

Q2: Using AI as a first-round editor is valuable because it gives immediate, non-judgmental feedback at any hour without the social anxiety of showing a bad draft to a person. It differs from having AI rewrite your work because in the feedback model, you are still the one making the writing decisions — you read the feedback and decide how to fix the paragraph yourself. The revision work, which is where learning happens, remains yours.

Q3: Answers will vary. Students who agree might cite the reading's point that AI-generated text can sound fluent but lacks genuine insight, making humans who can think independently more distinguishable and valuable. Students might also note that AI use is widespread, so everyone will have access to AI writing — the differentiator will be who can think and communicate without it when it matters.